

राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग एवं अवसंरचना विकास निगम लिमिटेड

सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार

तीसरी मंजिल, पीटीआई बिल्डिंग, 4-संसद मार्ग, नई दिल्ली-110 001

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited

Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India

3rd Floor, PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001, +91 11 2335 1282, www.nhidcl.com



BUILDING INFRASTRUCTURE - BUILDING THE NATION

CIN: U45400DL2014GOI269062

सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र का उपक्रम

A PUBLIC SECTOR UNDERTAKING

No. NHIDCL/DPR/Nagaland/Kohima-Bypass/2016

Date: 23/09/2016

To,

M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd	M/s Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria, S.L.	M/s S.M. Consultants	M/s Indian Tecnocrat Limited	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant
------------------------------------	--	----------------------	------------------------------	------------------------------------

Subject: "Consultancy Services for carrying out Feasibility Study, Preparation of Detailed Project Report (DPR) and providing pre-construction services in respect of 4 Laning of Kohima Bypass connecting NH-39 (New NH-02), NH-150(New NH-02), NH-61(New NH-29) and NH-39 (New NH-02) on Engineering, Procurement and Construction (EPC) mode in the state of Nagaland."-**Opening of Financial Bid regarding.**

Sir,


Please refer to your bid dated 03.08.2016 submitted towards subject cited project. The following is the final list of technically responsive Bidders. The financial bids of technically responsive bidders shall be opened on **30.09.2016 (1600 hrs)** in NHIDCL HQ, 3rd Floor PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001.

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Score	Status
1	M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd	83.49	Eligible for opening of financial bid
2	M/s Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria, S.L.	92.03	Eligible for opening of financial bid
3	M/s S.M. Consultants	—	Non-Eligible for opening of financial bid as Team Leader Failed to score minimum qualifying marks of 75%
4	M/s Indian Tecnocrat Limited	—	Non-Eligible for opening of financial bid (failed to score the minimum Qualifying marks)
5	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd.	90.55	Eligible for opening of financial bid

2. The copy of minutes of meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) dated 20.09.2016 is also enclosed.

3. In case of any representation, the bidders may represent by **29.09.2016(1100 hrs)**.

4. All the Authorized Representatives are requested to attend the opening of Financial Bids at the Scheduled date and time.


Y.C Srivastava
GM (T)

Subject: Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for the “Consultancy Services for carrying out Feasibility Study, Preparation of Detailed Project Report (DPR) and providing pre-construction services in respect of 4 Laning of Kohima Bypass connecting NH-39 (New NH-02), NH-150(New NH-02), NH-61(New NH-29) and NH-39 (New NH-02) on Engineering, Procurement and Construction (EPC) mode in the state of Nagaland” held at NHIDCL on 20.09.2016-(2nd Meeting)

The RFP for the subject project has been invited with bid due date being **03.08.2016** upto **1600 hrs**. The following bidders participated and submitted their bids.

S no	Name of the Firm
1	M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd
2	M/s Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria, S.L.
3	M/s S.M. Consultants
4	M/s Indian TecnoCrat Limited
5	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant



2. In the first meeting of ETEC dated 11.08.2016, the score obtained through infracon were discussed in detail and it was brought to the notice of Committee that the less score reflected through infracon is mainly due to missing details like date of birth, unfilled lane type, unfilled Bridge length, no of bridges, Arbitration cases, inappropriate selection of nature of assignment, alternate selection of mode of project etc. in the CV’s of key personnel uploaded on infracon portal. It was also brought to the notice of committee that the due to missing date / unfilled fields of CVs resulted into non-calculation marks by infracon evaluation as software designed to calculate 0 marks in case of any unfilled data which otherwise bonafide for scoring if done manually. The committee therefore for maintaining the transparency and to give equal opportunity to all consultants decided to request all consultants to fill the missing details on the INFRACON Portal. Accordingly consultant were advised to fill the details initially upto 19.08.2016 vide letter dated 18.08.2016, subsequently reminded vide email dated 30.08.2016.



3. The consultant firm and their key personnel have filled up the missing detail by 19.09.2016. It was also brought to the notice of committee that following discrepancies has been observed in the input sheet of evaluation filled by NHIDCL being first few evaluation through infracon portal have now been rectified and accordingly corrected on INFRACON Portal for the evaluation

Affected key personnel for this evaluation	Criteria	Experience required as per RFP	Discrepancies	Action taken for rectification
Team Leader	Experience in Highway projects	Experience in Highway Projects	Assistant Engineer, Assistant Executive Engineer and Senior Engineer were originally not considered in the input	Assistant Engineer/AEE Of state PWD are experiences in highway projects have been

↓


			sheet filled by NHIDCL resulted into 0/lesser scores	considered.
Geo Technical and pavement expert Traffic cum Safety Expert	Experience in Highway projects	Experience in Highway Projects	Assistant Engineer and Assistant Executive Engineer were originally not considered in the input sheet filled by NHIDCL resulted into 0/lesser scores	Assistant Engineer/AEE Of state PWD are experiences in highway projects have been considered.
Bridge Design Engineer	Experience in Highway / Bridge projects	Experience in Bridge Projects	(i) Assistant Manager (Design) was originally not considered in the input sheet filled by NHIDCL resulting into 0 score. (ii) For standalone bridge project 2/4/6 lane was necessitated in infracon sheet. However same is not required as per RFP through the key personnel has shown 2/4/6 lane in words but not filled the input sheet & kept it blank.	(ii) 2/4/6lane requirement is deleted from the input sheet of evaluation by NHIDCL.
Revenue survey expert	Experience in Highway / Bridge projects and experience in Similar capacity	Experience in revenue matters	It is noticed that some of retired Govt. revenue expert have not filled the cost of project and highway lane clarification resulted into 0 score.	Since retired revenue experts necessarily may not be dealing with highway projects whereas fulfilling the requirement of RFP. Since there is no requirement of experience of revenue expert on highway projects, therefore 2/4/6 lane option deleted in the input sheet of evaluation by NHIDCL.



The Details of change incorporated either by consultant or in input sheet is attached as Annexure-I. In order to maintain the transparency the complete evaluation process have been prolonged which was also necessitated due to nescient stage of INFRACON evaluation system which need continuous improvement till robust and error free system / software finalized. The software of INFRACON Portal may be corrected in due course for future evaluation considering above discussed issues. The copy of the final evaluated score through the INFRACON dated 20.09.2016 is also attached as Annexure II

4. Based on the filled up details in CV's by the consultant and modification in input sheet the CV's were evaluated once again through infracon and the marks obtained is as under.

Company Name	Firm's Relevant Experience In The Last 7 Years (Max. points 20)	Equipment and software (Max. points 5)	Qualifications and Competence of the Key Staff for the assignment (Max. points 75)	Total (Max. points 100)
Unique Team ID: 2016-268-115 C. E. Testing Company Pvt Ltd	20	5	58.49	83.49
Unique Team ID: 2016-268-123 Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria, S.L.	20	5	67.03	92.03
Unique Team ID: 2016-268-196 S.M. Consultants	15	4.5	59.43	84.43
Unique Team ID: 2016-268-373 Indian Tecocrat Limited	15	4.5	52.72	72.22
Unique Team ID: 2016-268-2538 HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd.	19	5	66.55	90.55

5. Four key personnel's of M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd i.e. Revenue/Survey Expert, Bridge Design Engineer, Contract Specialist and Hill Road/Tunnel Expert could not score the minimum qualifying marks of 75%. Committee noted that C.E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd may be asked to give replacement for the key professional who has scored less than 75% marks, if it becomes the preferred bidder at the time of negotiation as per Clause 6.6 of RFP. The reasons for their securing lesser marks are tabulated below.

S No.	Designation	Reasons for securing lesser marks
1	Revenue/Survey Expert	Educational Qualification was not matching as per RFP. Professional Experience was less than the required Professional Experience as per RFP
2	Bridge Design Engineer	Experience in Bridge projects was less than the required

		Experience in Bridge projects as per RFP
3	Contract Specialist	Required Educational Qualification was not mentioned in cv.
4	Hill Road/Tunnel Expert	Experience in Highway Projects was less than the required Experience in Highway Projects as per RFP.

6. All the key personnel's of **M/s Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria, S.L.** score more than 75% marks.
7. The Team Leader of **M/s S.M. Consultants** fails to score the minimum qualifying marks i.e. 75% marks. The Team Leader could only score 63.5 marks. As per clause 3.2.4 (i) of RFP "The CV of the proposed Team Leader should score at least 75 % marks otherwise the entire proposal shall be considered to have failed in the evaluation of Technical Proposals and shall not be considered for opening of Financial Proposals". Therefore, M/s S.M. Consultants is **technically disqualified.**
8. **M/s Indian TecnoCrat Limited** has failed to score the minimum qualifying marks i.e. 75% marks. Therefore, M/s Indian TecnoCrat Limited is **technically disqualified.**
9. All the key personnel's of **M/s Highway Engineering Consultant** score more than 75% marks.
10. Committee has also noted that CVs of all key professional have been locked as on 20 Sep 2016 and can be updated only for projects after 20 Sep 2016.
11. In view of the above, committee recommends that
- (i) Financial bids of the following firms to be opened with the approval of Competent Authority.
- (a) M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd
- (b) M/s Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria, S.L.
- (b) M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd.
- (ii) Following corrections / fields may be added in INFRACON Portal for future projects
- (a) All fields should be mandatory and no field shall be kept blank.
- (b) For other road / works there should be two more option of single lane and others may be incorporated to accommodate the projects other than NH / SH / Expressway.
- (c) Input sheet of Revenue Expert to be filled by profession may be reviewed as brought out above
- (d) Stand alone projects issues will be addressed once all input fields are made mandatory.
- (e) Input sheet of evaluation shall be made standardized.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to chair.



(V.K.Rajawat)
(ED-I)
Chairman



(Y.C.Srivastava)
(GM-Tech)
Member
Secretary



Adil Singh
(GM-Tech)
Member



A.K. Jha
DGM (Tech)
Member



Sunil Gupta
(Manager-Fin.)
Member